

Uses of Evaluation Findings: Taking a First-Year Industrial Program to the Next Level

Doreen Caruth, Practice Leader, Market Research
and Evaluation, Integrative Growth



Evaluation Utilization

- What is evaluation utilization?
- Benefits of evaluation utilization
- Recommendations expected from evaluators, but not often seen as a program staff requirement to take action (Peters, 2007)



Program History

Xcel Energy Alternative Conservation Improvement Program (CIP) Filing:

- Address financing gap in Xcel Energy's existing CIP programs
- Increase participation among commercial and industrial business customers
- Partner with economic development authorities to provide low-interest loans offset by energy savings
- Promote economic development through energy efficiency improvements (*grow jobs*)
- Save 1 trillion BTUs (*save energy*)



Program Partners



Contractors

- ✓ Promote program to customers
- ✓ Co-fund engineering studies
- ✓ Co-fund energy audits
- ✓ Promote program to contractors
- ✓ Provide low-interest loans
- ✓ Perform technical reviews
- ✓ Promote program to customers
- ✓ Install energy efficient solutions

Evaluation Utilization: A Case Study

- Process evaluation conducted in April 2011
- Program team reviewed findings and began acting on recommendations in August 2011
- Integrative Growth representative followed and documented actions of program team starting in September 2011



Evaluation Utilization Stages

- Stage 1: Review
Evaluation Deliverables
- Stage 2: Develop Action
Plan and Set Priorities
- Stage 3: Implement
Action Items



Stage 1: Review Evaluation Deliverables

- Program team debrief meeting to review:
 - Evaluation process flow and logic model
 - Final evaluation report, including recommendations
- Meet on a monthly basis
- Track progress



Stage 2: Develop Action Plan

Process Evaluation Recommendations	Program Team Action Item
Enhance program marketing efforts	X
Target mid-sized C&I manufacturing customers	X
Leverage the program through trade allies	X
Leverage partnerships with other agencies	X
Pursue repeat customers	X
Adjust financing tool to include lower interest rate	X
Incorporate loan payments into customers utility bill	
Develop additional sources of funding	
Expand rebates to cover broader range of EE measures	
Provide clear marketing guidelines/objectives to staff	
Enhance program tracking processes/database	
Strengthen communications among program team*	X

*Not a direct recommendation from the process evaluation

Stage 3: Implement Action Items

1. Enhance program marketing efforts
2. Target mid-sized commercial and industrial manufacturing customers
3. Leverage program through trade allies
4. Pursue repeat program participants
5. Strengthen communications among program team




Enhanced Marketing Brochures

REPRESENTATIVE PROJECTS			
Description	Project	Loan	Annual Savings
Food Processer	Cooling & Lighting	\$1,300,000	\$210,000
Foundry	Melting Furnace	\$1,500,000	\$250,000
Nanotech Facility	Chiller	\$150,000	\$16,500
Office Tower	Lighting	\$475,000	\$85,000
Hospital	Chiller & Lighting	\$1,450,000	\$165,000
Skate Manufacturer	Boiler	\$38,500	\$8,000

CONTACT
For more information or a loan application, contact:
PETE KLEIN, Vice President for Finance
Saint Paul Port Authority
(651) 204-6211 or Toll Free (800) 328-8417
info@sppa.com
WWW.SPPA.COM/TRILLION

- ✓ More focused on the customer and what it can do for them
- ✓ Case studies
- ✓ List of authorized projects
- ✓ Customer testimonials
- ✓ Eligibility criteria
- ✓ Branded to include all three organization partner logos



CASE STUDY

J&J Distributing, 100,000 square foot warehouse
Replaced 40 rooftop A/C units with a central A/C unit and upgraded the lighting system.

- Total project cost - \$1,300,000
- Annual Savings - \$210,000
- Annual Loan Payments - \$198,000
- Annual Positive Cash Flow - \$12,000

"I wanted my refrigeration to be more efficient and less of a carbon footprint. We had a lot of inefficiencies in our electric bill. I felt this was a very good way to solve the problem through a program where I could get a low interest loan that I could pay back based on my savings. So it was a win-win."

—Jim Hannigan, President, J&J Distributing

Future of Trillion Btu

Evaluation findings supported decisions on critical program elements...

- 2013-15 filing
 - Continuation and expansion of program
 - New pilot component focusing on mid-sized C&I manufacturing customers
 - Anticipated increase in loans dispersed and annual energy savings



For More Information



Doreen Caruth, Practice Leader, Market
Research and Evaluation

doreen.caruth@integrativegrowth.com

www.integrativegrowth.com

612-259-8308